

*Anvisningar till seminariet den 4 oktober 2013*

## **5. KÄLLKRITIK, DEN HISTORISKA METODEN?**

### **Diskussionsfrågor till litteraturen**

1. Sammanfatta de huvudsakliga skillnaderna mellan Thurén, Nilsson och Ågren i fråga om deras syn på vad källkritik är, vad den ska syfta till och hur den konkret ska bedrivas. Kan man se några likheter i deras diskussion av vad källkritik är och vad den ska användas till?
2. Vilka förändringar inom historievetenskapen under de senaste decennierna menar Ågren föranleder en utveckling av den klassiska källkritiken och vilka begrepp och arbetssätt föreslår författaren att historikern ska använda sig av för att utöva en utökad källkritik?
3. Jämför Nilssons och Ågrens resonemang kring källkritikens roll i dagens samhälle. I relation till din egen universitetsutbildning i historia eller idéhistoria och din bild av dagens svenska historievetenskap, upplever du att källkritiken har en central plats inom historieämnet?
4. Utifrån källkritiska principer, presentera olika möjliga tolkningar tidningsartikeln ”They are all dead by now”. Diskutera era tolkningar i gruppen och argumentera för den som du anser vara mest trovärdig!

## **Praktisk övning i källkritik (gruppövning)**

Nedan följer åtta utdrag ur texter som behandlar en och samma händelse i staden Ghulja (på uighuriska) eller Yining (på kinesiska) i den oroliga kinesiska provinsen Xinjiang (eller Östturkestan) i februari 1997. Läs texterna kritiskt och fundera nedanstående frågor:

1. Vilken eller vilka texter är mest trovärdiga? Varför?
2. Hur kan de fyra grundläggande källkritiska kriterierna (äkthet, oberoende, samtid och tendens) tillämpas på texterna?
3. Vilka förstahandskällor kan man tänka sig ligger till grund för redogörelserna?
4. Vissa av texterna är uppenbart tenditiösa. Betyder detta att de automatiskt bör förkastas eller kan vissa av uppgifterna ändå betraktas som trovärdiga?
5. Vilka ordval och förklaringar ger de olika texterna och vad gör detta för bilden av händelseförloppet?
6. Finns det någon eller några punkter där alla texterna är överens?
7. Tiger vissa av texterna om vissa delar av händelseförloppet eller aspekter av detsamma? Vad kan man i så fall dra för slutsatser av denna tystnad?
8. Kan man – och bör man – försöka “jämka” de olika uppgifterna i texterna och därigenom resonera sig fram till en form av kompromissversion av vad som kan ha hänt?

## **Gruppuppgift**

Försök själv att i ett eller två stycken sammanfatta vad ni tror hände och varför det hände! Er redogörelse ska grunda sig på en källkritisk analys av de sju texterna, och ni ska motivera varför ni accepterar vissa uppgifter och versioner av händelseförloppet och förkastar andra.

Gruppen skall göra en muntlig presentation av sin troliga version av händelseförloppet och sin bakomliggande källkritiska analys. Presentationen får inte överskrida fem minuter. Gruppen kan utse en person som presenterar resultaten, men om någon gruppmedlem har avvikande åsikter ska dessa också presenteras och motiveras muntligt.

## *Textunderlag till övningen*

1)

Information about the violent unrest in Yining on 5 and 6 February is still scant, with conflicting reports about the extent of the casualties and the number of arrests carried out. The protests, which turned into riots, reportedly involved more than 1000 ethnic Uighurs calling for independence from China.

No official account of the protests has yet been issued, though official sources have reported that nine people were killed and nearly 200 injured during the riots. Press reports have cited local officials as giving different figures, varying from 200 to 500, for the number of people detained during and after the unrest.

Unofficial sources claim that the death toll is much higher and that well over 1,000 people were detained. Some local residents have claimed that summary executions were carried out immediately after the rioting, but these reports remain unconfirmed. In the absence of independent observers in the city, which was sealed off after the riots, such claims cannot be confirmed.

Amnesty International, News Service, ASA 17/12/97, 14 February 1997.

Källa: <http://web.amnesty.org/library/index/ENGASA170121997> (2006-08-31).

2)

In February 1997, the town of Yining, fifty kilometers from the Kazakh border, witnessed large-scale rioting for two days when a peaceful demonstration was brutally put down by security forces. Casualty figures on the Yining riots vary from source to source, but according to one conservative estimate, nine people died and hundreds were injured over the two days. The authorities responded with a host of random arrests and new policy announcements. Mosque and religious schools were closed down, suspected activists rounded up, and public sentencing rallies were held across the region.

Human Rights Watch, Oktober 2001.

<http://www.hrw.org/backgrounder/asia/china-bck1017.htm> (2006-08-31).

3)

From February 5 to 8, 1997, the "East Turkistan Islamic Party of Allah" and some other terrorist organizations perpetrated the Yining Incident, a serious riot during which the terrorists shouted slogans calling for the establishment of an "Islamic Kingdom." They attacked innocent people, destroyed stores and burned and otherwise damaged cars and buses. During this incident seven innocent people were killed, more than 200 people were injured, more than 30 vehicles were damaged and two private houses were burned down. The terrorists attacked a young couple on their way home, knifing the wife to death after disfiguring her and severely injuring the husband. A staff member of a township cultural station was stabbed to death and then thrown into a fire.

Information Office of the State Council of the People's Republic of China, "East Turkistan' Terrorist Forces Cannot Get Away with Impunity" 21 January 2002.  
[http://english.people.com.cn/200201/21/eng20020121\\_89078.shtml](http://english.people.com.cn/200201/21/eng20020121_89078.shtml) (2006-08-31).

4)

On 5<sup>th</sup> February 1997, hundreds of young Uyghurs in Ghulja city had held a peaceful rally to protest Chinese religious and political persecution of the people of East Turkestan, and asked for the release of the Uyghurs who were arrested by the police arbitrarily. The Chinese police and other security forces crushed the demonstration by using brutal force, and massacred dozens of youth, including pregnant women and children, instead of listening to their grievances. The police poured cold water on the demonstrators in the freezing (up to 20 minus Celsius) winter weather and then fired on them with automatic guns. According to Uyghur eyewitnesses, 103 people had been killed and 184 critically injured at the result of the attack.

Enver Can, President of the East Turkestan National Congress, 4 February 2003.  
[http://web.radicalparty.org/pressreview/print\\_right.php?func=detail&par=4533](http://web.radicalparty.org/pressreview/print_right.php?func=detail&par=4533) (2006-08-31).

5)

At nine o'clock on a freezing but sunny morning in February 1997, a crowd of demonstrators set out to march through the streets. Hundreds of young people (thousands by some accounts) joined the demonstrations, carrying banners and shouting slogans, calling for the release of religious teachers, and demanding jobs for Uyghurs. [...] The protest march was not allowed to last long. About two hours after it had started, the demonstrators were stopped near the Ili Hotel, formerly the Russian consulate, by a large contingent of armed police and dog-handlers. Between 300 and 500 people were arrested, some bystanders among them. [...] Whether the violence broke out then or later is not clear. But by the next day the city was full of riot police and soldiers who "went through the streets arresting and beating people, including children".<sup>29</sup> In some places the police came under attack themselves, as did Chinese residents and shopkeepers, and the security forces retaliated with firearms. Unconfirmed reports said that dogs were set on the crowd, and that police flame-throwers and rifles were used. Officials said nine people, including four policemen, had been killed. Unofficially the toll was put at thirty, or a hundred, or four hundred.

Christian Tyler, *Wild West China: The Untold Story of a Frontier Land*, London: John Murray 2003.

---

<sup>29</sup> Amnesty International, "Gross Violations of Human Rights" [19 April 1999], p. 19.

6)

In early 1997, around the time of Ramadan, police arrested two Uyghur religious students (*talips*), resulting in a clash and dozens of arrests. The next day several hundred people demonstrated for the release of those arrested the night before; many of these demonstrators were themselves arrested; protests continued for the next few days and turned violent. Antiriot police and troops reportedly used dogs, tear gas, fire hoses, beating, and live ammunition on demonstrators and bystanders. Rioters torched vehicles and attacked police and Chinese residents; their banners and slogans included calls for Uyghur equality and independence as well as religious sentiments. Authorities sealed off Yining city for two weeks and in the aftermath of these events reportedly arrested thousands of people, particularly those associated with Islam. Several people died in the course of the riots.

James Millward, *Violent Separatism in Xinjiang: A Critical Assessment*, Policy Studies No. 6, Washington D.C.: East-West Center 2004.

7)

An eyewitness record of the disturbances in Yining was provided by Parhat Niyaz who was said to have escaped from Yining during the violence, and subsequently sought political asylum in the United States.<sup>1</sup> According to this testimony, the demonstration on February 5th and 6th was to demand the release of large numbers of Uyghurs who had been taken prisoner in a police swoop between February 1st and 4th. "[sic] At first, the police and the army used high-pressure hoses, and tear gas to try to disperse the demonstrators, but after some hours, they began to fire on the crowds. The weather was freezing and Niyaz claimed that almost 150 people froze to death because their clothes were soaked and another ninety were beaten to death on February 5th in the city and that hundreds more were injured and approximately 500 people were arrested. The following day, troops used machine guns on the crowd, both from the air and on the ground and 160 demonstrators were killed. The final death toll was 400; hundreds were wounded and as many as a thousand were arrested. All of those killed, injured and arrested were from the Uyghur community.

Michael Dillon, *Xinjiang – China's Muslim Far Northwest*, London and New York: Routledge 2004.

8)

This report attempts to describe the patterns of human rights violations in the region in recent years. It does not pretend to be comprehensive. In view of the strict control exercised by the Chinese authorities over information about these issues, the intimidation to which victims of human rights violations and their relatives are subjected, and the lack of access to the region by independent human rights monitors, it is difficult to crosscheck many reports of human rights violations and detailed information is available only about some areas and incidents. This report focuses mainly on patterns of human rights violations which Amnesty International has been able to document with various sources. In some instances it cites allegations made by single sources where the allegations refer to individual prisoners and particularly serious human rights violations, such as torture.

The information in the report is based on a wide variety of sources, including former prisoners,

---

<sup>1</sup> It is not possible to corroborate this evidence but it is quoted here in an edited version as its both graphic and convincing.

relatives and friends of prisoners, official Chinese documents and statements, reports in the local and national media, scholarly research and publications from academics and experts on the region, reports from Uighurs and foreign nationals of various professions, and reports in the international media.

On 5 February 1997, at 9 o'clock in the morning, several hundred young Uighurs started demonstrating through the streets of Gulja, holding banners, shouting religious slogans and calling for equal treatment for Uighurs. Unofficial sources say that the demonstration lasted for about two hours and was peaceful. At around 11.00 am the demonstrators were stopped by armed police units escorted by trained dogs. Arrests started soon after. According to some sources, between 300 and 500 demonstrators and bystanders were arrested on 5 February. The protests continued sporadically for two days, spreading to the suburbs, and rioting broke out in some areas. It is not clear when or how violence started. Some unofficial sources claim that there was no violence until 6 February, though too little is known about what happened across the city to confirm this claim. By 6 February, a large number of anti-riot squads and troops had been brought into the city. They reportedly went through the streets arresting and beating people, including children. In some areas, protesters reportedly attacked police or Chinese residents and shops and set fire to some vehicles, while the security forces reportedly opened fire on protesters and bystanders. Many people were killed or injured (see page , "extra-judicial executions".) Soon after, more troops were brought into the city, a curfew was imposed, the airport and the railway station were closed and the city was sealed off for two weeks.

Amnesty International has received many reports alleging that the security forces carried out arrests and treated people detained in Gulja during and after the protests with extreme brutality. One incident reported by various sources concerned a group of 300 or 400 of the demonstrators and residents arrested on 5 February. According to some sources, they were hosed with icy cold water by some soldiers or riot police in an open place, identified by some sources as a stadium, where they were temporarily held. The group, including some children, were reportedly kept there, wet, for two hours in the freezing cold February temperature. According to other sources, some young men and women among the detainees were forced to run barefoot in the snow. It is also alleged that one of the detainees, a young man identified as Abdu Gani, was taken away by soldiers when he tried to question their actions, and had a dog set upon him. Eventually, after two hours, those among the detainees who were suffering from severe frostbite were taken to hospital - some allegedly had to have their feet, fingers or hands amputated. The rest of the group was taken to prison.

Amnesty International, "People's Republic of China: Gross Violations of Human Rights in the Xinjiang Uighur Autonomous Region" ASA 17/18/99, April 1999.

<http://web.amnesty.org/library/index/ENGASA170181999> (2006-09-13).